

# Determinants of Principals' Performance in Colleges: a Gender based Analysis of Azad Jammu Kashmir

Mushtaq Haider Malik<sup>1\*</sup>, Zaheer Ahmed Khan<sup>2</sup>, Mohammad Irfan<sup>3</sup>

<sup>1</sup>Al Ittihad National Private School Al Ain UAE

<sup>2</sup>Department of Business and Economics Mazoon College Musqat Oman

<sup>3</sup>Management and Science University (MSU), Shah Alam Selangor Malaysia

\*Corresponding Author: Email: [mushtaqhaider@hotmail.com](mailto:mushtaqhaider@hotmail.com)

## Abstract

The current study examine the determinants of colleges' principal performance in Azad Jammu Kashmir, Pakistan. For this purpose, current study apply exploratory factor analysis and multiple regression analysis to investigate the determinants of colleges' principal performance in Azad Jammu Kashmir, Pakistan. The results of gender based analysis regression confirm that management development and supervision have a significant impact on principals' performance for male subgroup whereas management development, administration and planning have a significant impact on female principals' performance. The model R-square value for male is 57.5% and 81.1% for female. Therefore it is recommended that these variables are helpful in predicting performance of colleges.

**Keywords:** performance, supervisor, leadership, Pakistan

## 1. Introduction

Education sector is one of the most important sector in the economic development of many nation. The educational structure of Pakistan is problematic in terms of access, quality and equal opportunities for both males and females at all levels including the higher education. There are particular problems in the educational structure such as low motivation, low profile faculty, lack of financial as well as physical resources, outdated curriculum, and rote learning [1]. According to [2] leadership attitude of principals plays a vital role in implementation of large-scale innovation in education which is important for the success of the entire system as a whole. There have been many shifts in management accompanied by structural reform in education over the past decade in most developed economies and the role of the principals is assumed differently from previous generations of educators. A principal is one of the main stake holders in decision making as a head of the college.

In connection, management of educational institutions is one of the very important aspects of policy objectives of education department of any country. The role of the principals takes precedence over that related to administrative functions by privileging education and student achievement. Their role is combined with integrated functional areas like decision making, leadership, and curriculum planning and implementation of the strategies. Principals do play an indispensable role in the contribution of transformational leadership which is directly related to the teaching process involving the interaction between teachers, students and the curriculum [3]. The instructional-leadership role of the principal requires a robust understanding of content standards in educational management. Development of a strong cadre of leaders who have content expertise is the key to make a constructive impact on instructional practice [4]. Although

Azad Jammu and Kashmir is mainly a remote territory in Pakistan but literacy rate and school enrollment rate of students is better than other provinces of Pakistan. Different evaluation reports are evident that principals are in a paradoxical position.

Azad Jammu & Kashmir is located 150 km North East of Islamabad, the capital city of Pakistan. The state has a local government system under the control of Pakistan Government. The area is hilly and remote for access. The capital of AJK is Muzaffarabad. The history of education system in Kashmir can be divided into different distinct periods. The first university of this area "Sharda university" is recorded to be in the ages of Buddhist ruler Kanshik which is still a hallmark of educational institutions of Neelam District AJK. Students from different parts of the world including China, Tibet, Japan, Sri-Lanka, Thailand and Vietnam had been studying in this university. Renowned scholar Al Beruni in his book "Kitabul Hind" refers to Kashmir as a great learning center. At the time of Subcontinent division in 1947 there were two colleges in this area. In the last six decades there has been a good progress in the field of education. According to official reports of government, the literacy rate in AJK is 64% and student enrollment in primary school is 95% for boys & 88 % for girls.

The main objective of this paper is to examine the relationship between the different role of principal's and the performance of the college in District Azad Jammu Kashmir, Pakistan. The current study highlights the role of principals of colleges in Azad Jammu and Kashmir to enhance the performance of their institutions and management development as well. The educational structure of Pakistan is problematic in terms of access, quality and equal opportunities for both males and females at all levels including the higher education. The current study examines the relationship between management practices of principals and performance in Azad Jammu Kashmir colleges. The present study divides the analysis on gender bases, initially we discuss the outcomes which obtain from male student perspective and finally, we discuss the outcomes obtain from female students. The

remaining part of the study consist of following section. Section 2 explains the literature review about the job clarity and job satisfaction. Section 3 describes the methodology, section 4 clarifies the data analysis and discussion section and section 5 finalize the conclusion and policy recommendations.

## 2. Literature Review

The following section briefly explains the overview of the literature in associating the role of supervision, administration, leadership, planning and implementation and management development in influencing performance. We initiate our analyses with the study of [5]. The author suggest that principals work with the other staff members in team building scenario to gain superior performance of college. In transformation leadership the main focus is on communication to make decisions appropriately to ensure success. Thus when a change occurs in the organization, the principal's duty is to encourage other community accept for the change for good performance. On the other hand, [6] emphasize that resistance to change is a key feature in performance. The authors establish that at the time of any kind of developmental change in educational institutions the entire organization shows a resistance to implement new curriculum, new principal ship and technological transformation. Although, the entire system knows the fact that a particular change is for improvement and betterment for college, teachers, students, and parents. Most of the time the staff hesitates to accept change based on the expected failure they may encountered with. Parents' resistance is due to the fact that the change will take their extra time, energy, and effort. Learning new things is not always favorable option for teachers as well. In addition, [7] stated that limited staff is a major managerial issue by focusing on the problem of limited resources in educational institutes. The author further suggested that in order to operate and maintain the technology, the lack of technical support and staff is a vital issue influencing the performance. Additionally, colleges are often restricted in terms of physical boundaries such as buildings. These lacks of resources bring less self-efficacy and is obvious in students' poor performance.

Another significant aspect in educational performance and managerial capacity is the distinction of gender in executive level. Gender difference in educational management has been a recognized fact in educational management literature. Despite the cultural and contextual differences, the research on women in educational administration is remarkably similar across countries and cultures. The women are less likely to be represented in formal positions of leadership in schools than are men across all countries in the world. This is important that statistical findings on gender proportions in formal leadership positions are difficult in most countries. Especially, in case of developing countries assembling comparable statistics is not possible. Many studies has identified the barriers to the entrance of women into leadership positions include patriarchal societal structures and then devaluation of women within societies. The common factors are sex discrimination and reinforced stereotypes about female inadequacy and position of women in social context. The common societal expectations that women are responsible for child-care and home maintenance increase the workload for working women. These beliefs, assume the women to be less available for leadership positions by those who hire. Career decision making by women is also an important aspect in performing their role.

According to [8] many women make career decisions around issues of family, while many men make family decisions around issues of career. The literature showing different aspects on gender differences in leadership style is mixed. Some of literature is documenting differences and another reporting no differences. Some of the common traits in women leadership are different from male administrative approaches; women's leadership styles often include a focus on communication, collaboration, teamwork,

inclusiveness, and attention to instructional issues. In this regards, two main theories are evident. Some researchers say that males and females are very different and the other is that they are not so different and share many similarities in performing professional role in educational management. Some are the minimalists who argue that the differences between the genders are nonexistent or slight and irrelevant in most contexts. Hyde offered the similarities hypothesis and identified that males and females are similar on most psychological variables. On the other hand there are the maximalists who contend that the genders are different on many dimensions. They argue that the qualities of women are important, significant and of value. Such claim might be overinflated that gender differences carry substantial costs in areas such as the work place and relationships.

[9] attributed these claims to be related to situations and wrote that both differences and similarities are socially constructed rather than inherent. [10] reported in that the female commanders did not change the men's masculine stereotype of success leaders in military regardless of the level of performance. This study also indicated that successful female leaders perceived officers as having characteristics commonly associated with both men and women. Compare to successful leaders the less successful counterparts perceived successful military leaders as possessing characteristics, attitudes, and temperaments more commonly ascribed to women in general than to men. According to [11], possessing masculine characteristics continue to be associated with positions of leadership in organization as people tend to think that women and men should differ especially in those behaviors that are associated with larger sex differences. Contradictory to these perceptions that women are not suited for administrative positions are perceptions in which they excel in the role of administrator.

Apart from educational leadership role, women leadership is poorly attributed for the opportunities they avail. One of the important phenomena is the placement of women in organizations for a leadership role. This opportunity is not too wide and female get the opportunity but with less support as it is desirable. In the United States the percentage of female managers is 16.4% in the largest companies are women. The similar situation was remarked by [12] that the leadership has been predominantly a male prerogative in corporate, political, military, and other sectors of society. Although gains have been made in supervisory and middle management positions, women remain quite rare as elite leaders and top executives in corporate sector. Similarly, [13] establish that organizational capacity building is also a problem in developing countries. Increased autonomy has positive effects on the restructuring of governance and management, curriculum development, human resource management, financial arrangement and management, decision-making procedures, resource allocation and staff management and evaluation. Increased autonomy is also associated with increased accountability measures. At policy level governments are increasing accountability of the decision makers at institutional level (UNESCO, 2014).

In Pakistan there is a gap between education providers and the aspirations of the people which urges for initiating system-level reform. The population dynamics will make education several problems in the next decade if immediate steps are not taken. Pakistan needs sector wise educational reforms. Although local governments in provinces have chalked out road maps of educational reforms but that does not seems to be sufficient (International Crisis Group, 2014). Focusing on the challenges faced by Pakistan's educational institutes, [14] stated that the grand challenge of educational reform in Pakistan is its implementation. The problem in Pakistan's educational system is not what needs to be done, but who will do it and how they will achieve their aims through a sustainable implementation of an educational policy which reflects the needs of the time. Likewise, [15] emphasizes that decision making role of principals is very important in administrative role that influence performance. [16] wrote that policy of the government and its implementation is also

a factor in low influence of principals in college administration and leadership. Small rural schools are not immune from macro influences of policy and structural reforms. However, the challenges faced by all school principals appear to be amplified in rural areas, in particular, work intensification, role diversity, and school viability have more dramatic effects.

### 3. Methodology

The current research is based on 110 sample. A sample of 100 colleges was planned and 110 questionnaires were distributed to the principals of 100 colleges in Azad Jammu and Kashmir 50 each for boys and girls. 74 questionnaires were returned by the respondents duly filled. This sample size is almost 50 % of the population. The objective was to include about 50% of the population elements in the sample. Sampling size can be based on the researcher's consideration [17].

The present study has applied the techniques of exploratory factor analysis and multiple regression. The deployment of exploratory factor analysis aimed to reduce the items into final utilized variables that are obtained as a source of the correlational based

underlined structure. Furthermore, the current study utilized multiple regression analysis to investigate the dependency of performance on supervision, administration, planning and implementation, leadership and management capacities of the principals. The analysis of multiple regression will help to conclude the relative impact of the utilized predictors on the performance of colleges in the 74 colleges of Azad Jammu Kashmir. In addition, the exclusivity of the present study also rests in analyzing the relationship between dependent and independent variables by distinguishing the investigations of male and female respondents separately. The comparative examination of the predictors and criterion variables on the basis of gender will provide greater understandings of the relationship among the variables.

### 4. Data Analysis & Discussion

The data analysis was done with the help of software named (Statistical Packages for Social Sciences, SPSS) with the sample size of N=74. The results shown in table 1 are the structure of the data used in present research.

**Table 1:** Descriptive Statistics

	Frequency	Percent	Cumulative Percent
<b>Experience of the Principals</b>			
less than 3 years	41	55.4	55.4
3-5 years	27	36.5	91.9
More than 5 years	6	8.1	100.0
Total	74	100.0	
<b>Highest Degree of Principals</b>			
Doctorate	10	13.5	13.5
Master	64	86.5	100.0
Total	74	100.0	
<b>Type of Location</b>			
Town	47	63.5	63.5
area	27	36.5	100.0
Total	74	100.0	

Source: Author's Estimation

The results of table 1 explain that, we have total 74 number of respondents in which 41 (55.4%) have an experience of less than 3 years, 27 respondents (36.6%) have an experience between 3-5 years and total 6 respondents (8.1%) have an experience with more than 5 years. Moreover, out of 74 respondent, 10 respondents (13.5%) having a doctorate degree whereas, 64 respondent (86.5%) having a master degree. On the other hand, 47 respondents (64.5%) are belong to township area however, 27 respondent (36.5%) are belong to remote area of Azad Jammu Kashmir.

Exploratory factor analysis (EFA) intends to explore the links between the observed and latent variables as unknown [18]. Factor loadings represent the extent of the relationship among all variables to factors (Latent Variables). EFA provides the information about the factors that best represent the data by deriving the factors [19, 27]. Rotated component matrix initial process showed items to be deleted due to cross loadings.

[20, 25,26] suggested that variables with cross loadings of 0.5 or higher for each factor should be dropped from analysis. In the second round EFA was conducted after deleting the cross loadings of variable within different factors and the output of the remaining factors loadings is as following. The results of EFA confirm that, we have total five items for leadership, ten items for supervision, eight items for administration, five items for curriculum, seven items for performance and five items for management development in which factor loading values varies from 0.552 to 0.794 in all total 41 items loading. The minimum required value for factor loading is 0.55 as suggested by [21, 22,23,24]. In our case all the factor loading values are greater than 0.55. Therefore, we transform these items into an observed variables. The results of regression analysis is presented in Table 3. In this table, we have

the coefficient of regression which tell us that how much change is possible due to change of 1 unit of independent variable. Next, we have t-statistics values which tell us that whether an independent variable has a significant impact on dependent variable or not.

Displayed in table 3 are the results of multiple regression analysis. The findings of the study has revealed the dependency of the performance on supervision, administration, planning and implementation, leadership and management capacities of the principals by providing separate outcomes of male and female respondents. The results of male respondents established that management development and supervision plays crucial role in enhancing performance. Likewise, On the other hand, administration, leadership and planning & implementation have failed to show significant impact on college performance. The outcomes further established that supervision is the major influencer of performance and one unit increase in the standard deviation of supervision will enhance the college performance by 0.60 units. Similarly, one unit increase in the standard deviation of management development has the potential to increase the college performance by 0.20 units.

Alternatively, the results of female respondents provided contrasting findings. It establish that management development, administration and Curriculum planning and implementation are the significant factors of effecting college performance. The analysis further suggests that leadership and supervision had no role in influencing performance. The strength of the relationship concludes that curriculum planning and implementation is the most important predictor of performance suggesting that a unit increase in the standard deviation of the predictor variable will enhance the college performance by 0.74 units. Similarly, unit increase in the standard deviation of management development

will increase the performance by 0.21 units. Lastly, the administration tends to bring negative effects on the performance. The results suggest that unit increase in the standard deviation of administration has the potential to decline the performance by 0.34

units. This might be due to the fact that extreme focus on the administration is likely to abrupt the academic process and thus dismantle college performance.

Regression equation

$$Y = \beta_0 + \beta_1 X_1 + \beta_2 X_2 + \beta_3 X_3 + \beta_4 X_4 + \beta_5 X_5 + \varepsilon$$

**Table 2:** Results of Factor Analysis

Variables	Leadership	Supervision	Administration	Curriculum Implementation	Performance	Management Development
Cronbach Alpha	0.831	0.823	0.836	0.836	0.827	0.834
A1	0.602					
A2	0.587					
A3	0.552					
A4	0.741					
A5	0.615					
B1		0.794				
B2		0.654				
B3		0.728				
B4		0.619				
B5		0.606				
B6		0.606				
B7		0.623				
B8		0.572				
B9		0.595				
B10		0.661				
C1			0.704			
C2			0.694			
C3			0.695			
C4			0.737			
C5			0.708			
C6			0.712			
C7			0.648			
C8			0.619			
D1				0.644		
D2				0.767		
D3				0.581		
D4				0.643		
D5				0.605		
D6				0.754		
E1					0.621	
E2					0.669	
E3					0.613	
E4					0.707	
E5					0.580	
E6					0.604	
E7					0.555	
F1						0.617
F2						0.708
F3						0.619
F4						0.637
F5						0.738

Source: Authors Estimation

**Table 3:** Results of Regression Analysis

Variables	β	t-stats	Sig
<b>Male</b>			
(Constant)	3.224	1.585	0.563
Leadership	0.062	0.376	0.709
Management Development	0.204	2.219	0.033
Supervision	0.602	4.296	0.000
Administration	0.073	0.927	0.360
Curriculum planning & Implementation	0.022	0.182	0.856
<b>Adj. R-Square</b>	0.574		
<b>F-Stats (p-value)</b>	27.453 (0.000)		
<b>Female</b>			
(Constant)	12.247	1.901	0.094
Leadership	-0.360	-1.654	0.137
Management Development	0.209	2.023	0.078
Supervision	0.258	0.786	0.455
Administration	-0.342	-3.697	0.006

Curriculum planning & Implementation	0.742	4.268	0.003
Adj. R-Square	0.811		
F-Stats (p-value)	19.345 (0.000)		

Dependent Variable: Performance

The Regression equation for the role of male principals is;

Performance = 3.22 + 0.06 leadership + 0.60 supervision\*\*\* + 0.07 administration + 0.02 curriculum planning & implementation + 0.20 management development\*\*

Note: Where \*\*\* = 1% significance level, \*\* = 5% significance level and \* = 10% significance level

Regression equation

$$Y = \beta_0 + \beta_1 X_1 + \beta_2 X_2 + \beta_3 X_3 + \beta_4 X_4 + \beta_5 X_5 + \varepsilon$$

The Regression equation for the role of Female principals is;

Performance = 12.25 - 0.36 leadership + 0.26 supervision - 0.34 administration\*\*\* + 0.74 curriculum planning and implementation\*\*\* + 0.21 management development\*

Where \*\*\* = 1% significance level, \*\* = 5% significance level and \* = 10% significance level

## 5. Conclusion & Recommendation

The main objective of this paper is to examine the relationship between the different role of principal's and the performance of the college in District Azad Jammu Kashmir, Pakistan. The current study highlights the role of principals of colleges in Azad Jammu and Kashmir to enhance the performance of their institutions and management development as well. Female have been found significant in curriculum planning and development. In remote and hard areas the role of the principals was found insignificant in all their roles mentioned in this research. This is an important factor that the percentage of female principals is less than male which is just 30% (22 female principals in 30 colleges of women). 08 women colleges in survey are headed by the male principals. The obvious reason is unavailability of female principals or unwillingness of female principals to accept posting in hard areas. The male principal posting in women colleges is mainly in remote hard areas. 26 colleges located in remote areas were included in the survey. Gender and parities of heads of the colleges and location of the colleges is important fact to affect the performance of the colleges.

A major challenge facing policy makers and implementers of policy is to increase the effectiveness of educational leadership in colleges. Apart from resource limitation, to increase the performance of the colleges with available resources is a big challenge. The desirable outcomes expected from colleges that operate under very different circumstances are difficult to meet the expectations of educational department. Colleges are not the same, particularly in terms of social and locations conditions. Available circumstance in Pakistan does not allow equal treatment to bring equal opportunities for equal outcomes in terms of institutional effectiveness (UNESCO, 2011). For the increasing need for effectiveness, efficiency and competency in educational administration, it has become imperative that researchers in educational administration investigate the differences in the mode of administration of schools in terms of curriculum planning and implementation, personnel and school administration. Research has discovered that both male and female administrators displayed uniformity in the area of curriculum and instructional program and personnel administration as well. The current study in Azad Jammu & Kashmir shows a significant difference in the respect of male and female administrators.

## References

- [1] Aydin, A., Sarier, Y., & Uysal, S. The Effect of School Principals' Leadership Styles on Teachers' Organizational Commitment and Job Satisfaction. *Educational sciences: Theory and practice*, 13(2), 806-811,(2013).
- [2] Aziz, Bloom, Humair, Jimenez, Rosenburg, & Sather. Education System Reform in Pakistan: Why, When, and How? Germany: IZA,(2014).
- [3] Betz, B. J. Bases of therapeutic leadership in psychotherapy with the schizophrenic patient. *American Journal of Psychotherapy*, 17(2), 196-212,(1963).
- [4] Boyce, L. A., & Herd, A. M. The relationship between gender role stereotypes and requisite military leadership characteristics. *Sex Roles*, 49(7-8), 365-378,(2003).
- [5] Boyce, L. A., & Herd, A. M. The relationship between gender role stereotypes and requisite military leadership characteristics. *Sex Roles*, 49(7-8), 365-378,(2003).
- [6] Carr, J., & dan Griffin, M. *Business Research Methods*. Australia : South Western Cengage Learning ,(2010).
- [7] Dennis, M. R., & Kunkel, A. D. Perceptions of men, women, and CEOs: The effects of gender identity. *Social Behavior and Personality: an international journal*, 32(2), 155-171,(2004).
- [8] Dennis, M. R., & Kunkel, A. D. Perceptions of men, women, and CEOs: The effects of gender identity. *Social Behavior and Personality: an international journal*, 32(2), 155-171,(2004).
- [9] Eagly, A. H., Karau, S. J., & Makhijani, M. G. Gender and the effectiveness of leaders: A meta-analysis. *Psychological bulletin*, 117(1), 125,(1995).
- [10] Eagly, A. H., Karau, S. J., & Makhijani, M. G. Gender and the effectiveness of leaders: A meta-analysis. *Psychological bulletin*, 117(1), 125-135,(1995).
- [11] Elliott, R. Faculty development curriculum: What informs it?. *The Journal of Faculty Development*, 28(3), 35-46,(2014).
- [12] Hair, J. F. *Multivariate Data Analysis: A Global*. New York: Prentice Hall,(2009).
- [13] Halvorsen, & Skrøvset. Learning for leadership: leadership challenges and learning outcomes in the national school leadership program. *The national school leadership program*, 27– 42,(2014).
- [14] Jr, Lee Alvoid and Watt Lesley Black. *The Changing Role of the Principal*. Washington: Center for American Progress,(2014).
- [15] Kimball, R. " The Two Cultures" today. *NEW CRITERION-NEW YORK-*, 12, 10-10,(1994).
- [16] Liu, P. A transformational school leadership model in Chinese urban upper secondary schools. *International Studies of Educational Administration*, 41(3), 73-94,(2013).
- [17] Sayce, D., & Lavery, S. D. Beginning the school principalship in rural and remote Catholic Schools in Western Australia. Retrieved from [http://researchonline.nd.edu.au/cgi/viewcontent.cgi?article=1062&context=edu\\_conference](http://researchonline.nd.edu.au/cgi/viewcontent.cgi?article=1062&context=edu_conference) ,(2013).
- [18] Tabachnick, B. G., & Fidell, L. S. *Using multivariate statistics*. Allyn & Bacon/Pearson Education,(2007).
- [19] UNESCO, U. Decade of Education for Sustainable Development: Draft International Implementation Scheme,(2014) , 2005-2014.
- [20] Van Deuren, R. Capacity development in higher education institutions in developing countries. Retrieved from <ftp://ftp.repec.org/opt/ReDIF/RePEc/msm/wpaper/MSM-WP2013-30.pdf> , (2013).
- [21] Wijayanto, H., & Sumarwan, U. Analysis of the Factors Influencing Bogor Senior High School Student Choice in Choosing Bogor Agricultural University (Indonesia) For Further Study. *Journal of Education and e-Learning Research*, 3(3), 87-97, (2016).
- [22] Yanga, J. Y., & Yenb, Y. C. College Students' Perspectives of E-Learning System Use in High Education. *Asian Journal of Education and Training*, 2(2), 53-62, (2016).
- [23] Ihsan, A. Measuring the Efficiency of Tertiary Care Hospitals and Medical Colleges in Punjab, an Application of Non-Parametric Approach DEA. *Asian Journal of Economics and Empirical Research*, 4(1), 14-24, (2017).
- [24] Dierker, L., Evia, J. R., Singer-Freeman, K., Woods, K., Zupkus, J., Arnholt, A., ... & Rose, J. Project-Based Learning in Introductory Statistics: Comparing Course Experiences and Predicting Positive

- Outcomes for Students from Diverse Educational Settings. *International Journal of Educational Technology and Learning*, 3(2), 52-64, (2018).
- [25] Morgan, B. M., & Alcocer, L. F. Descriptive Comparison of Hispanic Doctoral Students (2007-2014) with Carnegie Initiative of the Doctorate National Survey Results. *American Journal of Education and Learning*, 2(1), 14-22, (2017).
- [26] Ayodeji, O., & Olajoke, A. S. A Syntacto-Phonological Analysis of the English Language Spoken by National Diploma (ND) I Students in Rufus Giwa Polytechnic Owo, Ondo State, Nigeria. *Global Journal of Social Sciences Studies*, 2(1), 33-38, (2016).
- [27] Rizal, S. S. Developing Model of Syntactical Extricating in Translation Variants of Burns a Red Red Rose as a Practical Study for Indonesian Students Translation Class. *International Journal of English Language and Literature Studies*, 5(1), 72-83, (2016).